



STATE OF RHODE ISLAND AND PROVIDENCE PLANTATIONS  
HISTORICAL PRESERVATION & HERITAGE COMMISSION  
Old State House 150 Benefit Street Providence, RI 02903

Telephone 401-222-2678  
TTY 401-222-3700

Fax 401-222-2968  
[www.preservation.ri.gov](http://www.preservation.ri.gov)

MINUTES  
RHODE ISLAND HISTORICAL PRESERVATION & HERITAGE COMMISSION  
September 14, 2016

I. MEMBERS PRESENT

Mr. Michael Abbott, AIA  
Mr. Mohamad Farzan, AIA  
Dr. Patrick Malone  
Dr. E. Pierre Morenon  
Mr. Kevin Nelson, representing the Associate Director of the Division of Planning  
Dr. Ronald Onorato  
Mr. Pieter N. Roos  
Mr. Edward F. Sanderson, State Historic Preservation Officer  
Mr. Clark Schoettle

STAFF PRESENT

Ms. Joanna Doherty, Principal Architectural Historian  
Mr. Jeffrey Emidy, Deputy Director  
Dr. Timothy Ives, Principal Archaeologist  
Ms. Michaela Jergensen, Senior Reviewer RIDOT Projects  
Ms. Katherine Pomplun, Senior Grants Coordinator  
Mr. Glenn Modica, Senior Project Review Coordinator  
Ms. Sarah Zurier, Principal Special Projects Coordinator  
Ms. Elizabeth Warburton, Senior Architectural Historian

MEMBERS ABSENT

Mr. Al Cocce, AIA, representing John P. Leyden, State Building Commissioner  
Mr. Darin Early, COO, Commerce RI  
Mr. Michael Hebert, NR Review Board  
Mr. Karst Hoogeboom, Chairman  
Ms. Lisa Lawless representing Janet Coit, Director DEM  
Ms. Ruth Taylor  
Vacant

GUESTS

Ms. Kathryn Cavanaugh  
Ms. Barbara Rubine, Edgewood Waterfront Preservation Association

## II. AGENDA

### 1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 9:40 A.M., Dr. Onorato presiding in place of Mr. Hoogeboom, Chairman.

### 2. Minutes of June 8, 2016

On a motion by Dr. Morenon, seconded by Mr. Farzan, the Commission unanimously VOTED to approve the Minutes of June 8, 2016.

### 3. Executive Director's Report

Ms. Pomplun reported on the State Preservation Grants Program

#### a) 2015 SPG Grantees

- RIHPHC made 25 awards in the 2015 grant round, totaling \$1.8m
- Of these, 2 projects were canceled before beginning work per request of the grantee (Greenwich Odeum and Warren Armory)
- 1 project has completed construction (Providence Public Library)
- 2 projects experienced startup delays, but are now proceeding (NK Old Town House and Central Falls City Hall).
- As of today, construction is underway at 3 sites.
- On August 24, staff took representatives from the state budget office, legislative fiscal offices, and the Governor's office on a statewide tour of SPG sites to see the bond money "in action." The grantees were enthusiastic and engaged hosts and they all demonstrated themselves to be excellent stewards of their historic properties.
  - Sites visited included Providence Public Library, the "Stone House"/Hilton Bleachery, Clemence-Irons House, the Chinese Tea House at Marble House, Smith's Castle, and South County Art Association.
  - Rep. Marvin Abney, House Finance Committee Chair, joined the group at the Chinese Tea House tour stop and spoke highly of the program and PSNC's project.

#### b) 2016 SPG Applicants

- We received 27 applications by the deadline of August 19.
- 4 of these are ineligible for evaluation.
  - 3 still need to close out prior SPG awards.
  - 1 was incomplete and did not provide required materials, despite being given extra time to comply.
- 23 applications will be evaluated by staff and the review panel.

- 18 of the grant requests are for Large Projects (>\$45,000) and 5 are for Small Projects (<\$45,000).
- The grant requests total \$2.1m
- Staff and review panel are currently reviewing and scoring the applications. Calendar of next steps is as follows:
  - Sept. 28 – Staff meeting to discuss scores
  - Oct. 19 – Review panel meeting to discuss scores
  - Nov. 30 – Staff meeting to rank applications
  - Dec. 7 – Review panel meeting to rank applications and make final recommendations
  - Dec. 14 – Commission meeting to vote on final recommendations
- A list of the 2016 applicant sites is attached.

c) New Requirement for Future SPG Grantees

- Staff have concerns that the SPG Funding Agreement does not require Grantees to continue to carry out the public programs described in their grant application, and we have little to no recourse if, after completion, a grantee's site is not used as a Museum, Cultural Arts Center, or Public Historic Site.
- To remedy this, we have added the following language to the General Conditions of the Funding Agreement:

*“The GRANTEE and the COMMISSION agree that upon completion of the project, the historic building being assisted by this grant will be used as a “Museum,” “Cultural Arts Center,” or “Public Historic Site” as defined in the SPG Rules and Regulations and as described in the grant application. The GRANTEE and the COMMISSION may jointly agree in writing to changes in the program of uses described in the grant application, provided that the use is consistent with use as a Museum, Cultural Arts Center, or Public Historic Site. In the event of a violation of the SPG Rules and Regulations and/or the historic building is not being used as a Museum, Cultural Arts Center, or Public Historic Site, the COMMISSION shall consult with the GRANTEE and attempt to resolve the issue. If the violation is not corrected within a reasonable period of time or if use of the historic building as a Museum, Cultural Arts Center, or Public Historic Site is not resumed, the Grantee shall repay the amount of the State Preservation Grant to the State of Rhode Island. The Grantee agrees that these provisions shall remain in effect for a period of TEN (10) Years.”*

During discussion, Mr. Schoettle suggested that the repayment provision be added to the historic preservation easement. On a motion by Dr. Malone, seconded by Mr. Abbott, the Commission

VOTED to approve the addition of the repayment provision to the SPG funding agreement and historic preservation easement.

d) FFY 2017 CLG Calendar, Funding Priorities, and Selection Criteria

- Applications will be available for download on our website by Friday, Sept. 30 and due by Friday, Dec. 9.
- Funding recommendations will be presented for vote at the February Commission meeting on Weds. Feb. 8.

CLG Grant Selection Criteria for FY2017 were presented; they are unchanged from FY2016. Following discussion, on a motion by Mr. Schoettle, seconded by Mr. Abbott, the Commission unanimously

VOTED to approve the CLG Grant Selection Criteria for FY2017.

- e) Mr. Sanderson reported that the National Park Service is in discussion with the Old Slater Mill Association to acquire title to the historic site as part of the new National Historical Park. NPS would like RIHPHC to release its 50-year historic preservation easement. During discussion, Dr. Malone, a former executive director of Slater Mill Historic Site, expressed support for the NPS proposal and cautioned that the ownership and use of the historic dam should also be considered. Other Commissioners also expressed support, but felt that RIHPHC should review NPS documents: release of the easement and quit claim deed to the property. The documents should include a statement of the preservation purposes of the transactions. Mr. Roos suggested that in the event that NPS ownership and management of the Slater Mill should terminate, the RIHPHC 50-year easement should be automatically reinstated. On a motion by Mr. Abbott, seconded by Mr. Roos, the Commission unanimously

VOTED support for NPS ownership and release of the RIHPHC easement, subject to review of the documents.

#### 4. National Register of Historic Places

Preliminary Review: First Universalist Church, 78 Earle Street, Woonsocket

Elizabeth Warburton presented information about the property, which is the subject of a pending State Preservation Grant application.

The former First Universalist Church building is located in Woonsocket, Rhode Island at the corner of Earle and Snow Streets, north of downtown Woonsocket. Constructed in 1924, the church was designed by Gorham Henshaw and includes a sympathetic 1957 addition designed by Arland A. Dirlam. The 1924 section is 2 stories above a raised basement, with yellow-brick walls, stone lintels and beltcourses, a flat roof with parapet, and a heavy Gothic-Revival style surround on the principal entrance, which is offset and faces Earle Street. The 1957 addition is separated from the original block with a rectangular tower with louvers and a low-pitch hipped roof; the 1957 addition is 1-story with yellow-brick walls, projecting brick piers, vertical stained

glass windows, and a gable roof.

The interior of the 1924 section includes a multipurpose sanctuary and theatre space on the second floor, with Gothic-Revival bracketing, a wooden coffered ceiling, a raised altar/stage, and a choir loft. Below the main sanctuary, the rooms on the first floor are divided into classroom space, as well as a handsome minister's study with built-in bookcases and bracketed fireplace surround. The basement level includes a period kitchen and pantry with original cabinetry and soapstone sinks. The 1957 addition is a more traditional church sanctuary design that retains its altar, pews, stained glass, organ, and fixtures. The midcentury modern stained glass attributed to Janowski Associates features stylized Biblical scenes. The building retains a high level of integrity on the exterior and interior.

The First Universalist Church was founded in 1839 by followers of Hosea Ballou, the "Father of Universalism" who preached in Woonsocket in the mid-1830s. Rev. John Boyden, a close follower of Ballou, was the first minister who supervised construction of a church at the corner of Main and Church Streets in downtown Woonsocket. By the early 1920s, Rev. E. Dean Ellenwood prioritized the construction of a new church that would allow the congregation to expand. Gorham Henshaw designed a Gothic Revival church for the chosen site at the corner of Earle & Snow Streets; only a portion of this design was executed. The first services were held in the new building in February 1925. The simple, multipurpose design of the original sanctuary represented both the Universalists' emphasis on personal relationships with God and a functional choice to allow the space to be used for events. The church hosted theatre and musical performances as well as guest-preachers and Universalist conventions throughout the 20<sup>th</sup> century, serving as an active community organization in Woonsocket. By the 1950s, nationally-recognized church architect Arland A. Dirlam was chosen to design an addition. Dirlam's addition is sympathetic to the Gothic Revival design of the original building and includes vertical brick piers and Gothic-influenced lintels. On the interior, the addition more clearly dates to midcentury, with coursed concrete block walls, simplified ornament, and contemporary stained glass. The church continued to be an active organization throughout the mid-20<sup>th</sup> century, hosting the Rhode Island Universalist Convention in 1968 and being designated as the second most active parish in the Universalists' Ballou-Channing District that encompassed Boston, southeastern Massachusetts, and all of Rhode Island. By 2007, however, the parish had dwindled and formally disbanded. A tenant, the American-French Genealogical Society, was given right of first refusal and purchased the building for use as a genealogical and research center that actively celebrates and promotes the history of French-Canadians in the U.S.

The First Universalist Church is the only example of a Universalist Church in Woonsocket, a city where Hosea Ballou and other pioneers of the religion frequently gathered. Several ministers and members of the congregation were prominent both in the religious community and in Rhode Island business and politics. The church survives as one of the only physical examples of this history in Woonsocket. The church is also architecturally significant for its associations with architects Gorham Henshaw and Arland A. Dirlam and its high level of integrity.

During discussion, Commissioners inquired about a c. 1924 image depicting the original sanctuary space with a gabled roof and how the conversion to a coffered ceiling - probably by

Gorham Henshaw not long after construction was completed - may have altered the roofline of the building; the Commissioners requested that this be further investigated prior to the final National Register presentation. Commissioners Abbott and Schoettle commented that the associations with Hosea Ballou and the social history of Universalism in Woonsocket appeared to qualify the building under Criterion A. On a motion by Mr. Abbott, seconded by Mr. Farzan, the Commission unanimously

VOTED preliminary approval for nomination of the property to the National Register.

Final Review: Aberdeen Plat & Sally Greene Homestead Plat, Edgewood-Cranston

Joanna Doherty presented information about the properties.

The Aberdeen Plat and Sally Greene Homestead Plats Historic Districts are being nominated to the National Register under the Multiple Property Documentation Form, *Historic and Architectural Resources of the Edgewood Neighborhood, Cranston, R.I.* (2009). The RIHPHC has been working for several years with the City of Cranston to complete nominations in Edgewood. In 2015, the RIHPHC awarded two Certified Local Government grants to the City to support the Aberdeen Plat and Sally Greene Homestead Plats Historic Districts nominations, which were prepared by Kathryn Cavanaugh. Once these two districts are listed, over 600 properties in Edgewood – the core of the neighborhood – will be listed in the National Register.

The Aberdeen Plat and Sally Greene Homestead Plats Historic Districts are located in northeastern Cranston, about four miles south of downtown Providence; they abut one another. The Aberdeen Plat Historic District occupies approximately 27 acres from Broad Street on the west to the Providence River on the east, and from Berwick Lane and Sefton Drive on the north to Chiswick Road on the south. It includes 105 mostly residential properties, the majority built between 1900 and 1930, though construction dates range from ca. 1901-11 to 1957. The district also includes approximately two acres of waterfront open space: the northern part of the City-owned Stillhouse Cove Reservation (the southern portion is included in the Edgewood Historic District – Taft Plat). Seventeen of the properties in the district are non-contributing by virtue of age (built after the period of significance) or because of extensive alterations that have significantly diminished their integrity.

The Sally Greene Homestead Plats Historic District occupies about 22 acres from Broad Street on the west to the Providence River on the east, and from Glen Avenue and Harbour Terrace on the north to Massasoit Avenue and Hudson Place on the south. It includes 107 mostly residential properties, built primarily between 1900 and 1930, though construction dates range from ca. 1900-11 to 1963. Six of the properties in the district are non-contributing because of extensive alterations that have significantly diminished their integrity.

In both districts, the dwellings are predominantly single-family, though there are two- and three-family examples as well. Most are 1 to 2.5-stories tall and wood-frame, though brick and stucco are also present. Buildings exhibit a range of popular 20<sup>th</sup>-century architectural styles, including Late Victorian, Colonial Revival, Bungalow, Four-Square, Dutch Colonial Revival, Cape Cod,

and Ranch in the Aberdeen Plats Historic District and Late Victorian, Colonial Revival, Dutch Colonial Revival, Bungalow, Four-Square, Ranch, and Moderne in the Sally Greene Homestead Plats Historic District. Elements of two or more styles are frequently mixed together.

The Aberdeen Plat and Sally Greene Homestead Plats Historic Districts both meet National Register Criteria A and C at the statewide level of significance. They meet Criterion A in the area of Community Planning and Development for their ability to illustrate the development of the Edgewood neighborhood in northeastern Cranston into one of metropolitan Providence's most desirable suburbs. The Aberdeen Plat was once part of a large country estate established in the mid-19th century for a wealthy manufacturer, which was subdivided for residential development in 1901. The Sally Greene Homestead Plats Historic District evolved from farmland in the mid-19th century, when Sally Greene died, to a series of residential subdivisions recorded between 1897 and 1936, all of which were fully built out by 1963. Following a pattern established by other Edgewood subdivisions, both districts developed on the model of streetcar or early automobile suburb, with a regular grid of streets and relatively generous lots, upon which predominantly single-family dwellings were constructed for occupancy by mostly middle-class and upper-middle-class residents. The Aberdeen Plat and Sally Greene Homestead Plats Historic Districts also meet Criterion C in the area of Architecture. Both contain a wide range of late 19th and early 20th century types and styles, often mixed together in unique interpretations. The period of significance for the Aberdeen Plat Historic District is 1901 to 1957, while the period of significance for the Sally Greene Homestead Plats Historic District is 1897 to 1963. In both cases, the beginning date represents the date of the first recorded plat in the district and the end date corresponds to the construction of the last contributing building in the district.

Following discussion, on a motion by Mr. Farzan, seconded by Mr. Roos, the Commission unanimously

VOTED to approve the Aberdeen Plat and the Sally Greene Homestead Plat National Register historic district nominations.

5. Other Business: There was no other business.
6. Next regular meeting date: Wednesday October 12, 2016 at 9:30 AM.
7. Adjourn: The meeting adjourned at 11:15 AM.

Minutes recorded by,



Edward F. Sanderson, Executive Director  
State Historic Preservation Officer

<b>APP#</b>	<b>Site</b>	<b>City</b>
<u>16-01</u>	Beavertail Light	Jamestown
<u>16-02</u>	Fort Adams	Newport
<u>16-03</u>	Varnum Armory	East Greenwich
<u>16-04</u>	Coggeshall Farmhouse	Bristol
<u>16-05</u>	AFGS HQ/Veterans Museum	Woonsocket
<u>16-06</u>	Town Hall	East Greenwich
<u>16-07</u>	PPAC	Providence
<u>16-08</u>	Betsey Williams Cottage	Providence
<u>16-09</u>	St. Mary's Church	Newport
<u>16-10</u>	Pawtucket Public Library	Pawtucket
<u>16-11</u>	Read Schoolhouse	Coventry
<u>16-12</u>	Edward King House/Senior Center	Newport
<u>16-13</u>	Kendall Dean School/New Town Hall	North Smithfield
<u>16-14</u>	Fort Adams Visitors Center	Newport
<u>16-16</u>	Looff Carousel	East Providence
<u>16-19</u>	Nehemiah Angell Barn	Foster
<u>16-20</u>	Linden Place	Bristol
<u>16-21</u>	Paine House Museum	Coventry
<u>16-22</u>	BIHS museum aka Woonsocket House	Block Island
<u>16-24</u>	Hale House	South Kingstown
<u>16-25</u>	Wilcox Park Bandstand	Westerly
<u>16-26</u>	Naval Reserve Armory	Bristol
<u>16-27</u>	Natl Museum of American Illustration	Newport

## 2016 State Preservation Grant Applications



## FFY 2017 CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT GRANTS Funding Priorities and Selection Criteria

### ELIGIBLE CLG PROJECTS

Applications may be submitted for projects which provide for the identification and evaluation, planning and protection, and public awareness of properties and sites listed in or considered eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Eligible properties include individual sites and buildings, historic districts and buildings which are considered contributing elements of a historic district.

### FFY 2017 FUNDING PRIORITIES

The RIHPHC will receive applications for CLG grants in the subject areas listed below. The RIHPHC will evaluate all applications received and will give special attention to those which address important preservation needs within the applicant community or to a statewide preservation need. The State Historic Preservation Plan adopted by the RIHPHC and the historic preservation element in local community comprehensive plans will provide the context for evaluating project applications. Special consideration will be given to those projects which address the needs of an endangered property or properties which have extraordinary significance.

#### Statewide Projects

1. annual statewide historic preservation conference
2. training sessions for members of local historic district commissions
3. other activities which address a statewide preservation need

#### Identification/evaluation of Historic Resources

1. surveys, especially of resources not yet evaluated, such as underwater wrecks, or whose documentation does not meet current standards
2. preparation of National Register nominations
3. data management such as creating or updating databases or GIS systems

#### Planning Activities

1. preparation of the preservation component of a community comprehensive plan
2. any preservation activity identified in a community's comprehensive plan as necessary
3. preparation of ordinance drafts, rules, etc.

#### Public Education Activities

1. documents in print and electronic media related to the operation of historic district zoning, such as brochures, standards, guidelines
2. other print or electronic documents, such as walking tours, surveys, etc.
3. signage, such as wayfinding signs for historic districts, plaques, etc.
4. curriculum development, docent training, etc. for historic properties and places

#### Resource-specific Activities

1. architectural and engineering plans and specifications
2. engineering reports
2. feasibility studies
3. historic structures reports and cultural landscapes reports

#### PROJECT SELECTION CRITERIA

The RIHPHC will score and rank grant applications and award grants based on the above funding priorities and project selection criteria as follows:

**National Register Significance:** This criterion rates relative architectural and historical significance of properties affected by the project activity. Projects involving properties which are eligible or recommended for listing on the National Register receive priority. Rare, unique, or key landmarks merit special consideration.

**Project Need:** This criterion rates the need and importance of the proposed project. Projects are encouraged which are an appropriate step in the development of the particular local historic preservation program. Projects involving issues identified in the Commission's comprehensive planning process, projects addressing historical resources with special needs, and projects which further local planning efforts are preferred.

**Project Impact:** This criterion rates the extent to which the public may directly benefit from the project. Projects with broader or statewide impact rank higher than those with local impact. Applications for seed money which can lead to a larger or multi-phase project may have greater impact than a more limited project.

Other factors considered include geographic distribution of grants awarded throughout the state; priority consideration to cities and towns which have approved affordable housing plans; administrative capacity to successfully carry out a grant project, including previous experience in managing grants; and projects which match federal grant funds with cash matching share are encouraged.

Ability to meet general program requirements is also considered including compliance with applicable federal regulations, and presenting a scope of work which can be accomplished within the allotted time framework.